

**IMPLEMENTING A SPANISH/ENGLISH DUAL-LANGUAGE BILINGUAL
PROGRAM IN A DIVERSE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL SETTING**

by

Jacklyn Richir

A Master's Thesis/Project Capstone
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Science in Education
Teaching English to Students of Other Languages
Department of Language, Learning, and Leadership
State University of New York at Fredonia
Fredonia, New York

May 2019

State University of New York at Fredonia
Department of Curriculum and Instruction

CERTIFICATION OF THESIS/PROJECT CAPSTONE WORK

We, the undersigned, certify that this project entitled IMPLEMENTING A SPANISH/ENGLISH DUAL-LANGUAGE BILINGUAL PROGRAM IN A DIVERSE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL SETTING by JACKLYN RICHIR, Candidate for the Degree of Master of Science in Education, Teaching English to Students of Other Languages, is acceptable in form and content and demonstrates a satisfactory knowledge of the field covered by this project.



Robert Dahlgren, PhD.
Master's Capstone Advisor
EDU 691 Course Instructor
Department of Curriculum and Instruction

5/17/2019

Date



Kate Mahoney, PhD.
Department Chair
Department of Language, Learning, and Leadership

5/31/19

Date



Dean Christine Givner, PhD.
College of Education
State University of New York at Fredonia

5/31/19

Date

IMPLEMENTING A SPANISH/ENGLISH DUAL-LANGUAGE BILINGUAL PROGRAM IN A DIVERSE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL SETTING

ABSTRACT

With the passage of Part 154 in New York State, Bilingual Education has become more prominent and necessary in public schools with a high population of English Language Learners (ENLs). Dual-language Bilingual Programs have become increasingly more significant because they are designed to build bilingual and biliterate learners from a variety of home languages. This curriculum project is designed to assist schools, specifically Dunkirk City School District, in implementing a Dual-Language Bilingual Program in an elementary school. The curriculum project includes guidelines for assessment and accountability, curriculum, instruction, staff quality and professional development, program structure, family and community engagement, and support and resources. Although this program is specific to one district, with modifications it could be implemented in other districts as well.

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
English as a New Language Programming.....	1
Personal Interest.....	3
Project Purpose.....	4
Literature Review.....	5
Bilingual Programs and their Effectiveness.....	5
Transitional Bilingual Programs and Single Strands.....	5
Dual-Language Bilingual Programs.....	6
Methodology.....	10
Conceptual Framework.....	10
Audience.....	11
Procedures.....	12
Scope and Sequence.....	15
Validity.....	18
Results.....	19
Vision Statement.....	19
Assessment and Accountability.....	19
Curriculum.....	20
Instruction.....	20
Staff Quality and Professional Development.....	22
Program Structure.....	22
Family and Community.....	24
Support and Resources.....	25
Year 1 Implementation Plan.....	27
Discussion and Conclusion.....	29
Significance.....	29
Limitations.....	31
Future Investigations.....	32
References.....	34

Implementing a Spanish/English Dual-Language Bilingual Program in a Diverse Elementary School Setting

Introduction

America has seen an increasing number of students with a home language other than English in schools today. This rise in language diverse students has led to the argument about the type of educational programming that is best for these types of students (Blum Martinez & Baker, 2010). Schools and states must make decisions about programming which include Transitional Bilingual Programs, Dual Language Bilingual Programs, and English as a New Language programming (NYSED, n.d.). These programs must address the larger issue at stake, that Latino elementary and secondary students often score 20 points lower than do their White peers in both reading and mathematics (Brooke-Garza, 2015). School districts must make decisions on appropriate programming in order to close this achievement gap. In the following chapter, I will elaborate on the need for bilingual programming as well as my personal interest in this particular project.

English as a New Language Programming

Many researchers have studied the various effects of different types of English as a New Language (ENL) programming. These studies often serve as guides to determining the program that will work best for a specific school district. Brooke-Garza (2015) studied two-way dual language bilingual education and the effects that it had on Latino students. She found in her study that within a dual-language program there was a socioeconomic divide in the classrooms. She recommends that Two-Way Bilingual Inclusion (TWBI) educators address this divide within the classroom. The author states: "Differences in socioeconomic status influence the social dynamics and validation of cultural capital. Educators need to be cognizant of how this may play

out in the classroom and address it with professional development and training that focuses on meeting the needs of low-income students.” (p. 82).

Bilingual education has been a controversial program dating back to its national inception in 1968. A variety of factors are must be considered during the implementation of bilingual education programs, many factors that are affected more by politics than by pedagogy (Blum Martinez & Baker, 2010). Laws governing the status of other languages often positively or negatively affect the way that bilingual education is viewed.

Consistency of programming and expectations have been researched by Colón & Heineke (2015). Through a qualitative case study, they researched the realistic appropriation of language policy in bilingual education classrooms. They found that due to a lack of clear language expectations and communication, there was inconsistency in the implementation of bilingual education. Similarly, de Jong & Bearse (2014) researched views on a bilingual program that was a single strand within a middle school. They found that there was a conflict between the views of the bilingual program versus the views of the school itself, leading to a disconnect. The authors commented: “The study highlights the challenges that may accompany the implementation of a TWI strand in a traditional middle school structure. Both marginalized position and the status of the Spanish TWI classes and the ‘de-coupling’ of Spanish and English component of the program had significant consequences for the extent to which bilingual perspectives were visible and heard in the school.” (p. 27). They concluded that integration of views and supports are necessary in implementing an effective bilingual education program. Finally, DeNicolo (2016) also explored a transitional bilingual education program within a school and found that the implementation and interpretation of a bilingual program is essential in avoiding terms such as *school within a school* and the sense of division.

Bilingual education very clearly has a positive impact when implemented correctly. Dworin (2011) studied the language and literacy practices of 5 graduates formerly enrolled in a Spanish-English K-12 dual language immersion program. The main findings of the study showed that the former students reported being bilingual and biliterate but, also that native English speakers may be reaping more of the benefits in a dual language immersion program. The authors commented: “It seems that while dual language immersion programs have been successful in producing bilingual and biliterate graduates, most of them are white European Americans. So addressing the issue of few Latina/o students continuing with a program is one that needs to be taken seriously if such programs are to be equally beneficial for Latino/a students” (p. 120). Kibler, Salerno, and Hardigree (2013) did a similar study that examined adolescents’ insights into a two-way dual-language program. Their findings suggested that the program provided opportunities for students to recognize their ethnolinguistic identities and understand language in a more conceptual manner. The authors reported: “Students repeatedly voice appreciation for being able to work with students of different language backgrounds and noted their otherwise lack of opportunities to do so within school...At the school- and district-level, students’ reported learnings from LAB highlight the unique affordances of a two-way dual-language environment that allows students formal and informal language interactions they otherwise would not have.” (p. 270). The outcomes of these bilingual education programs positively impacted the students in a cultural aspect as well as linguistically.

Personal Interest

As an elementary educator in a school district with a large emergent bilingual population, my interest in this project is based upon providing better programming for our students.

According to the most recent ENL/BLE law, Part 154 (2015):

Each school district in which the sum of each school's Annual Estimate of Enrollment of English Language Learners equals 20 or more English Language Learners of the same grade level, all of whom have the same home language that is other than English, shall provide a sufficient number of Bilingual Education programs in the district in the following school year, such that there are Bilingual Education programs available in the district for at least seventy percent (70%) of the estimated English Language Learners students who share the same home language other than English and grade level districtwide. (p. 15)

Our lack of a bilingual program is detrimental to our students' success in language and content standards, which contributes to our students consistently underperforming on district and statewide assessments. Also, as New York State (NYS) policies are changing, it is necessary for the district to provide a bilingual program according to current emergent bilingual numbers.

Project Purpose

The main purpose of this project is to create an implementation plan that the district can use to implement a bilingual program. It will guide the district in policy-making, program environment and management, parent involvement, and curriculum needs. This guide will be created by looking at current policies, discussions with Teaching English to Students of Other Languages (TESOL) professionals, and incorporation of research based-strategies and ideas. Having a specific guide will also provide the district and teachers with clear expectations in order to avoid the misappropriation of language in the classroom (Colón & Heineke, 2015). In the next chapter, I will review the relevant literature on different types of bilingual programs to determine appropriate programming for this curriculum project.

Review of the Literature

In the previous chapter, I introduced the problem of effective bilingual programs for English Language Learners (ELLs) in schools. The purpose of this chapter is to review the literature on this topic and to analyze the research that has previously been completed.

Bilingual Programs and their Effectiveness

As the population of ELLs in most schools increases, so does the need for effective programs that will help these students to succeed academically. One common topic that many educators are currently discussing is bilingual programs. The two different bilingual programs included are Dual-Language Bilingual Programs and Transitional Bilingual Programs. This literature review will provide educators with evidence necessary to make a decision about the type of bilingual program that would be appropriate for their students' needs. In turn, the education field would benefit from research that is focused on different bilingual programs.

Transitional Bilingual Programs and Single Strands

Transitional bilingual programs and bilingual programs with single strands within schools are two programs that ELLs may be placed into. De Jong and Bearse (2014) analyzed the effects of a two-way immersion (TWI) bilingual program that is a single strand within a traditional middle school environment. The researchers utilized teacher interviews, student surveys, and focus groups. Results determined that having the single-strand of TWI in the traditional middle school did not actively support the intentions of a TWI program. The researchers stated:

Our findings indicate that linguistic equity, a core principle of TWI programs, was undermined by programmatic language allocation choices (only two out of seven classes were taught in Spanish) and by the lower status of the Spanish language arts class as a foreign language class, that was not considered part of the academic

team. The study also found that the separation of the Spanish and English component of the program negatively affected teachers' ability to provide a bilingual curriculum, restricted expectations for teachers' ELL expertise to the TWI classes, and encouraged English dominant perspectives on TWI students.

(p.27)

The researchers suggested that integrated supports must be implemented in order to support TWI goals. This study is relevant to research because it illustrates the importance of school-wide supports for a bilingual program.

DeNicolo (2016) completed a similar study focused on the interactions between general education and bilingual teachers within a Spanish/English transitional bilingual program. Data collected focused on teacher perceptions and attitudes about the bilingual program and the ways in which this affected school climate the program function. Results showed that there was a divide between the Transitional Bilingual Education program and the school itself. This research is important in bringing to light the significance of connecting bilingual programs with the general education curriculum and school.

Dual-Language Bilingual Programs

Another type of effective programming that ELLs may be placed into is Dual-Language bilingual programs. These programs typically include students with both English and the other language as a home language. Dworin (2011) focused on the language and literacy practices of 5 Spanish-English K-12 dual language immersion program graduates. This research occurred with the use of semi-structured interviews that were later coded. Results showed that all graduates considered themselves bilingual and biliterate and that there were two language ideologies: Spanish as a functional language and as a cultural language, and that there were more benefits

for native English speakers in the programs, because more of them completed the program. The researchers commented: “If these observations, and others like them, are accurate then it suggests that few of the Latino/a students continue with the immersion program beyond elementary school and that many may not be in the college track in high school.” (p. 120) This research is essential in identifying strengths and weaknesses in K-12 dual-language bilingual programs.

Kibler, Salerno, and Hardigree (2013) utilized interviews and audio recordings to determine the ways that adolescents reported learning about themselves, language, and learning when taking part in an extracurricular dual language program. They found that students recognized linguistic and cultural differences and became aware of their own linguistic learning. The researchers stated: Students repeatedly voice appreciation for being able to work with students of different language backgrounds and noted their otherwise lack of opportunities to do so within school.” (p.270) This research highlights the benefits of a dual language bilingual program in the high school setting.

Parkes’ (2011) study included a survey of 724 families of students at 8 dual language bilingual schools. The study focused on parent satisfaction with the program. Findings showed that parents were highly satisfied with the programming and their child’s skills. Parent concerns included math skills, academic challenge, and home-school communication. The author’s reported: “Communication with parents about their child’s academic performance and other indicators of the child’s skills in order to help parents have accurate knowledge about them seems important.” (p. 716). This research is relevant in creating a positive family-school relationship within a bilingual program.

Brooke-Garza (2015) completed a Participatory Action Research study of 8, two-way bilingual immersion teachers. Participants recognized and reflected on the power imbalance of cultures and then worked to develop culturally relevant practices that would encourage cross-cultural competency in the two-bilingual classrooms. The researchers commented: “Witnessing social, cultural, and linguistic imbalance, and struggling to ameliorate this inequity creates a fertile ground for teachers to become advocates” (p. 82). Findings showed that the strategies benefited the Latino English learners which created stronger two-way bilingual programs. This research is prevalent in providing strategies for bilingual education teachers to incorporate culture in the classroom.

Finally, Colón and Heineke (2015) focused on the ways that teachers take district, state, and school policies and requirements and implement them into their everyday classroom use. Research was conducted using participant observation, field notes, surveys, and interviews to gather data. Results showed that teachers were not consistently implementing bilingual education programming due to schedule conflicts, new initiatives, and high-stakes testing that did not put an emphasis on the language other than English (in this case Spanish). The researchers stated: “Overall, the pressures from English-only initiatives and assessments - outside of and separate from the bilingual education policies and programs - had an impact on the figured world of bilingual education.” (p. 283). This research is essential to analyzing and improving policies in bilingual education to best fit needs of school districts in correlation with a variety of policies in other topics.

All of these studies worked to identify strengths and weaknesses amongst dual-language bilingual programs. Examples of strengths included student attitudes, linguistic diversity, parent

satisfaction, and linguistic ability. Examples of weaknesses included language allocation, program fidelity and implementation, and who the program is benefiting.

Conclusions

This literature suggests that there are benefits from both Transitional and Dual Language Bilingual Programs; however, Dual Language Programs are typically more successful in promoting bilingualism. Research also shows that without significant support from all stakeholders, any bilingual program will not be successful.

After reviewing the literature, the purpose of this curriculum project is to create an implementation guide to be used in a school implementing a bilingual program. I chose to structure this using a Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual Program because it was the most effective after the review. In the next chapter, I will detail the methodology used to create my curriculum project.

Methodology

My curriculum project will aim at creating an implementation plan for a Dual Language Immersion Bilingual Program to accommodate the growing population of English Language Learners (ELLs) as well as the demand for bilingual children. This project is significant because as the population of ELLs increases, so does the demand for appropriate programming in order to ensure proper language development. According to the most recent ENL/BLE law, Part 154 (2015):

Each school district in which the sum of each school's Annual Estimate of Enrollment of English Language Learners equals 20 or more English Language Learners of the same grade level, all of whom have the same home language that is other than English, shall provide a sufficient number of Bilingual Education programs in the district in the following school year, such that there are Bilingual Education programs available in the district for at least seventy percent (70%) of the estimated English Language Learners students who share the same home language other than English and grade level districtwide.... (p. 15)

Due to this new change, many school districts are out of compliance with the current law. My goal is to create a comprehensive plan that allows districts to implement effectively a successful program consisting of culturally relevant pedagogy, linguistic diversity, and cultural/linguistic acceptance. In the following chapter, I will detail the methodology used to create this implementation guide.

Conceptual Frameworks

This project is based on multiple qualitative studies and case studies. These studies

focused on the effectiveness of Dual Language Bilingual Education Programs as well as criticisms of the programs as well. A primary finding was that Dual Language Bilingual Programs need to be accepted as a school culture rather than a single strand within a school, which will be reflected in my own programming (Brooke-Garza, 2015; Colón & Heineke, 2015; de Jong & Bearse, 2014; DeNicolo, 2016) Once this project is completed, it could be implemented in multiple different districts with modifications that I will mention later in this chapter. These situations could then be analyzed in a case study or qualitative study as well to observe the effects that the program has had on student attitudes about culture, language proficiency, and academic achievement.

Audience

My plan is to create an implementation curriculum for a Dual Language Immersion Bilingual Program in an Elementary School (K-5). I will be creating this program specifically for a Title 1 district in a city that currently has 4 elementary schools and a large population of Spanish Speaking ELLs, but I also am hoping that it will be able to be transferred to other school districts with necessary modifications. This program will be for both Native Spanish and English speakers, as it is a Dual Language Program. Parents will have to enroll their students in the program, and it will be important that students stay in the program throughout their elementary career. It will be a commitment for both parents and students. The current population of ELLs in this district originate from Puerto Rico, Mexico, and Guatemala, therefore I will aim to include these cultures in the programming. Due to a lack of bilingual teachers in the area, this program will consist of half English speaking teachers and half bilingual teachers to allow for maximum use of instructional time and space. It is my hope that this project will be able to be presented to the Board of Education in an attempt to improve the district's programming for ELLs.

Procedure

During the course of developing this program plan, I took the following steps:

Step One: Author's Background

Growing up in Fredonia, New York, I knew I always wanted to be a teacher. I had positive experiences in school; however, I was never truly exposed to people of other races or languages. I continued my education in undergraduate at SUNY Fredonia, and, during my junior year, I traveled to Belize City, Belize in order to teach in schools for two weeks. This life-changing experience enlightened me to the needs of people from other cultures and also built a desire in me to work with children from poverty. I returned to Belize again the following year and when I graduated from SUNY Fredonia, I was blessed enough to earn a job in the Dunkirk City School District. It was while working in this district that I decided to pursue my Master's Education in Teaching Students of Other Languages (TESOL). I felt that this would be the most beneficial for me as well as my students because they were students that I was working with daily. As I continued in the program, I became deeply interested in the most effective ways to teach ELLs, and bilingualism and bilingual education became a topic of discussion consistently.

Step Two: Choosing a Topic

When choosing a topic, initially I wanted to research the effectiveness of a Dual-Language Bilingual Program. I have always been interested in different types of bilingual programs and wanted to compare the different types of programing and effects that they had on student achievement. However, after consideration, the passion of creating something that could be used and applied to my daily life became more important. Rather than researching bilingual

programs, my goal changed to creating a Dual-Language Bilingual Program that could be implemented in the district that I work in.

Step Three: Conducting a Needs Assessment

I was interested in working specifically with the elementary population in Dunkirk, New York. In order to determine the appropriate programming components, I met with the previous English as a New Language administrator, English as a New Language teachers, parents of students, and I analyzed the makeup of the district population. I also met with professionals from the local college that teach in the Teaching Students of Other Languages (TESOL) program. I learned that parents were interested in having their students learn another language, and that a bilingual program had previously been implemented, but it failed due to lack of bilingual teachers. I then made it my goal to create a plan for implementation of an effective dual-language bilingual education program.

Step Four: Identify the Audience

As I researched more about the Dunkirk City School District and its components, I learned that the majority of the ENL population spoke Spanish as their home language. This led me to decide that a Spanish-English bilingual program would be most effective. Also, I decided to open this up to both English and Spanish speakers by doing the dual-immersion program. I came to this decision because as an English only student myself, I find that knowing Spanish would have been very beneficial to me when looking for a job as a college graduate. Being bilingual is becoming more desired, and it shouldn't be limited only to students that speak a language other than English at home.

Step Five: Determine Program Components

When deciding where to plan this program and the way to create this plan, I looked at many implementation plans that had already been created. I reached out to our former ENL director, and she was able to lend me the prior implementation guide for the Transitional Bilingual Program that unfortunately failed. This allowed me to gather data about the program components and I was able to analyze why it may have failed. I also analyzed many Dual-Language program documents that I was able to access through the Educational Resources Informational Center (ERIC) database. This allowed me to determine the necessary components and requirements for the guide.

Step Six: Conduct Literature

I began my research using the SUNY Fredonia library's online database system. I chose ERIC to begin my research, as it was the most broad and would provide me the vast amount of information I needed. I began my searching terms such as *bilingual*, *dual-immersion*, *implementation*, *guide* as well as a combination of many other words about the topic. I narrowed my search down by only choosing peer-reviewed sources that were relevant to my topic. I then found common themes among the literature and began outlining important components of my implementation guide.

Step Seven: Review Dual-Language Bilingual Programming

I also reviewed multiple other guides from different school districts that were available to me online. I chose requirements and components from these programs to provide me with a snapshot of what the program would look like. A former trip to a dual-language bilingual school

in Buffalo, NY also provided me with some of the background knowledge to get a vision of what the program entailed.

Step Eight: Plan and Design a Program Guide

For this project I analyzed research on current Dual Language Immersion Bilingual Programs. I will determine the parts of the programming that were effective, and the components that are necessary for the one I am creating. This will also allow me to determine the parts of the program that need to be followed to fidelity and those that can be modified for specific district use. I also informally interviewed staff of the school district on their views about the programming and how they envision it being most effective. One major informal interview that I am planning is the with the previous director of the English as a New Language program, as this will give me significant insight into the state of ELLs in the district and the programming requirements.

Scope and Sequence

This project will contain a baseline plan for implementation. It will cover the first year of implementation as well as an extension into the ways that the program can be continued. It will consist of different components such as curriculum, scheduling, assessments, school culture, and class sizes. There will be plenty of room for modifications in this program, as there will be many “bumps in the road.” However, there are certain aspects that should be followed to fidelity to ensure correct implementation. Many of the concepts in this plan will be aligned with the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education. The Guiding Principles provide a rubric to be used when evaluating a program, which is what I referred to when creating the implementation guide (Howard, Sugarman, Christian, Lindholm-Leary, & Rogers, 2007).

Strand 1: Assessment and Accountability

The first strand explains the importance of accountability and assessment through six principles. The guide addresses this through the requirements of specific assessments for students and progress monitoring of student growth (Howard, et. al., 2007). Making an assessment calendar as well as an analysis of required assessments (Mahoney, 2017) is important for teacher accountability and monitoring program success.

Strand 2: Curriculum

The second strand explains the creation and adaptation of curriculum as well as the coordination of curriculum amongst grade levels and support services (Howard, et. al., 2007). To accommodate this, the guide provides a schedule with appropriate planning time for teachers to meet with grade level partners and support staff. Coordination with grade level partners will be significant because classes will be split amongst 2 teachers, one Spanish speaking and one English speaking.

Strand 3: Instruction

The third strand exemplifies the importance of significant, research-based strategies that support multilingualism (Howard, et. al., 2007). To support this, the guide provides language allocation schedules as well as strategies that teachers are expected to use. Multilingual classroom environments and projects will be shown throughout the school. Examples of these strategies are also included in this section of the guide. Professional development will also be provided on multiple topics such as SIOP (Vogt & Echevarría, 2011) and flexible grouping.

Strand 4: Staff Quality and Professional Development

This strand emphasizes the importance of recruiting high quality staff with optimal professional development opportunities for all staff (Howard, et. al., 2007). In order to address this, the guide will suggest pairing with professionals in the Teaching Education to Students of Other Languages (TESOL) Program at State University of Fredonia to recruit ideal candidates to teach in the school. There will also be a suggestion of significant professional development opportunities for current teachers.

Strand 5: Program Structure

The fifth strand provides guidelines for the support of bilingualism, cross-cultural competence, equality amongst cultures and language, and a program for continued program planning, implementation, and evaluation (Howard, et. al., 2007). To address this, the guide identifies a planning and evaluation team. There are also specific language allocation standards within the school. This section also identifies classroom makeup to ensure equality amongst language and cultures within the classroom.

Strand 6: Family and Community

This strand emphasizes the importance of parent and community outreach in reference to the program. It encourages parents-as-partners in learning and the support of bilingualism from parents and community (Howard, et. al., 2007). To foster this, the guide includes a plan for parent engagement including orientations and plans to invite parents into the school and classroom regularly. The guide also includes necessary staff including a home-community liaison and bilingual office staff. Requirements for students enrolled in the program also ensure positive parent involvement and support.

Strand 7: Support and Resources

The final strand illustrates the importance of staff, parent, and community support as well as any funding that is available to ensure the success of the programs (Howard, et. al., 2007). In the guide, there are examples of available funding opportunities that the district can utilize. Also, there are many suggestions and examples of community outreach opportunities including posters, flyers, and ads to ensure community and parent support. Lastly, there is a list of bilingual resources and books provided to encourage a diversity of language and literature.

Validity

Although this curriculum is being designed specifically for one school district, my goal is that it can be easily adapted to be implemented in other districts as well. Examples of this include daily scheduling, due to different start and end times, and staffing needs based on enrollment. As I previously stated, certain components of this program need to be followed to fidelity, however the types of languages being implemented and cultures being represented can be adjusted to match student needs.

Conclusions

I feel as though my curriculum project meets the problem that the school district is facing. After research on different types of bilingual programs, the Dual Language Program approach was chosen because it met all of the needs of the district. Having a Dual Language Program meets the language needs of the ELLs while expanding their knowledge of Spanish literacy as well. In the next chapter, I will present the results of my curriculum project in the form of an implementation guide.

Results

The following section contains the implementation guide aligned with the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education. Each principle contains information on the ways to meet the criteria of the rubric as well as supplementary materials and resources.

Vision Statement

Through the support of staff, parents, and the community, this Dual Language Bilingual Program will create students who are bilingual, biliterate, and bicultural through the use of a research based framework and guiding principles.

Assessment and Accountability

The assessments used by the program should be decided upon by either a committee or by the entirety of the staff in the program. Professional development on necessary components of an assessment should be provided prior to program start (Mahoney, 2017). Shown below is a table representing different assessments, the language they are assessing, and the purpose of each assessment.

Assessment	Audience	Language	Purpose
STAR Reading (BOY, MOY, EOY)	2nd-5th	English	To determine a student's reading skills in English.
STAR Reading Spanish (BOY, MOY, EOY)	2nd-5th	Spanish	To determine a student's reading skills in Spanish.
STAR Math (BOY, MOY, EOY)	K-5th	English or Spanish	To determine a student's math skills.

STAR Early Literacy (BOY, MOY, EOY)	K-1st	English or Spanish	To determine a student’s early literacy skills.
NYSESLAT (Yearly)	K-5th	English	To determine a student’s proficiency level in English.
NYSITELL (Once)	Upon arrival into program	English	To determine a student’s initial proficiency level in English.

Curriculum

It is necessary for all instructional staff to determine the needs of the students in regards to curriculum using the New York State Standards (New York State P-12 Common Core Learning Standards, n.d.). To ensure this, there will be one week of mandatory professional development in early summer to look at multiple versions of Spanish Language Arts, English Language Arts, Science, and Social Studies curricula. All teachers and administration will be included in this process. The curriculum chosen must meet state standards, be culturally relevant, and build across grade levels. It is suggested that Eureka Mathematics Curriculum be used for math instruction in both English and Spanish (New York State Math Curriculum, n.d.).

Staff will also be provided 45 minutes, three times a week, in order to meet with their grade-level partners. Discussions between partners will include any behavioral and academic needs, as students work with both teachers daily. Grade-level partners should create cohesive classrooms with the same expectations to ensure stability for all students. Staff will also meet quarterly across grade-levels in order to discuss expectations and needs in each grade-level. This will occur on a professional development day without students.

Instruction

Adequate language instruction across content areas in both languages is necessary for appropriate language needs. In order to meet these language needs, the school must follow a

strict language allocation schedule. Students may only talk to their English teacher in English and Spanish teacher in Spanish. This promotes language use rather than students reverting back to their home language. It is necessary for content areas to rotate between languages so students obtain vocabulary and language in all content areas. This is not necessary for Specials teachers (Art, Music, and P.E.) due to the lack of bilingual instructors in these areas. The suggested language allocation schedule is shown below:

Instruction in Spanish

Instruction in English

Grade Level	Quarter 1	Quarter 2	Quarter 3	Quarter 4
Kindergarten	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA
Grade 1	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials
Grade 2	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA
Grade 3	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials
Grade 4	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA
Grade 5	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials	ELA Math Specials Science/S.S. SLA	SLA Math Science/S.S. ELA Specials

Staff Quality and Professional Development

Staff quality is necessary for successful implementation of the dual-language bilingual program. The teaching staff is required to have certain credentials and certificates in order to acquire such positions. Also, due to the dual-language nature of the program, both Spanish speaking teachers and English-speaking teachers should be trained in second-language acquisition and bilingual theory. SUNY Fredonia, the local college, has a Teaching English to Students of Other Languages (TESOL) program that would be an effective place to recruit teachers for the program. It is also important to note that not every teacher needs to be bilingual to teach in the program. Current district staff may get their bilingual certification or ESOL certification with tuition support from the district.

Professional development opportunities should be provided on a regular basis. Prior to the program beginning, all staff should be trained in dual-language program expectations, the Sheltered Instruction Observation Protocol (SIOP) model (Vogt & Echevarría, 2011), translanguaging (Celic & Seltzer, 2013), and the multilingual environment. Suggestions for in-service days include teacher work groups to create content and language objectives as well as analyze data and curricula.

Program Structure

It is necessary that the entire school community be clear about and committed to their vision and goals based on bilingualism, biliteracy, and multicultural competence. This entire school community includes all staff, students, and parents. The program takes an additive bilingualism approach, whereas students are trying to obtain an additional language rather than strictly learn English.

The environment of the program should contain equality among languages. All posters, projects, and signs should be provided in both languages side-by-side rather than on top of one another. There should be an equal amount of English and Spanish environmental print in all hallways, offices, and classrooms. Also, all letters going home and automatic phone calls should be in both languages.

In order to obtain an equality of languages within the classroom, each class will be made up of 50% English speaking students and 50% Spanish speaking students. The following chart identifies classroom make-up and sizes throughout the program.

Grade Level	Maximum Students	Language Ratio
Kindergarten (2 Classes)	18	50% English: 50% Spanish
Grade 1 (2 Classes)	18	50% English: 50% Spanish
Grade 2 (2 Classes)	20	50% English: 50% Spanish
Grade 3 (2 Classes)	20	50% English: 50% Spanish
Grade 4 (2 Classes)	24	50% English: 50% Spanish
Grade 5 (2 Classes)	24	50% English: 50% Spanish

Due to the structure of the program, and the building upon languages, it is necessary that families enrolled in the program commit to remaining in the program through their children’s elementary school years. Students may not enter the program after Kindergarten unless they have already been in a similar program or have the language skills similar to the students already in the program.

To maximize the number of students able to be enrolled in the program, as well as utilize available staff, classes will alternate throughout the day. They will receive instruction from their English teacher strictly in English, and from their Spanish teacher strictly in Spanish. The following chart represents a typical schedule of one grade level:

Grade Level Schedule:

Time:	Class A	Class B
8:15-9:30 am	Spanish Language Arts	English Language Arts
9:30-10:30 am	Math	Science/Social Studies
10:30-11:00 am	Gym	Music/Art
11:00-11:30 am	Music/Art	Gym
11:30 am-12:00 pm	Lunch	Lunch
12:00-1:15 pm	English Language Arts	Spanish Language Arts
1:15-2:15 pm	Science/Social Studies	Math

To ensure that the program is being implemented effectively, an evaluation team will be created consisting of parents, teachers, and administrators. The goal of this team will be to evaluate the program based on the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education rubric. In the first year of implementation, they will be meeting quarterly in order to evaluate different aspects of the program and to provide different suggestions for improvement and implementation. After the first year, the team will meet twice a year.

Family and Community

As stated in the vision statement, it is necessary that the community and families be supportive of the program in order for it to be successful. To ensure that families are supportive of the program, they need to apply for their children to be enrolled. To maximize enrollment, families may be invited to the program if staff finds that they would benefit from it. Family commitment to both languages is essential for student success. There will be multiple opportunities for families to learn about the program as well as be involved.

Some suggestions for family and community involvement include the following:

- Family recruitment night: Families will be invited in to learn about the program and what it consists of
- New student orientation: Families will be provided an initial orientation outlining the requirements of being enrolled in the program.
- Hispanic heritage night: Families will be invited to participate in to learn about the Hispanic Culture. Projects may be created by students, food may be served, and different traditions may be represented.
- Family literacy night: Families will be invited in to play different literacy-based games with their child.
- Parent conferences: parents will be invited in to discuss their child's progress with both of their child's teachers.

It is also important for the program to gain support from the community. The community already has a large Hispanic population, therefore it is likely that it will be well accepted.

Volunteers should set up information booths at different community events as well as send out informational pamphlets to prospective students. All resources going to the community should be presented in both English and Spanish as well as in print and audio format (radio, tv commercial, posters, etc.).

Support and Resources

There are multiple grants provided by the state that the district can apply for in order to support this program. In order to stay in compliance with Part 154, the state is providing a \$250,000 NYSED Bilingual Education Grant for \$50,000 per year for five years. This grant can be used to purchase curricula, bilingual books and classroom resources, assessment kits, and

supplement teacher salary. It can also be used to further the education of staff and professional development.

In order for teachers to have appropriate bilingual resources in the classroom, a bilingual book list is necessary as well as a bilingual library. Below is a suggested bilingual book list for the district specific to Kindergarten, the first year of implementation. This book list correlates with the current Common Core State Standards and Curriculum taught.

Title	Author
<i>Usar los Sentidos en la Escuela</i>	National Geographic
<i>Siete Ratones Ciegos</i>	Ed Young
<i>El Oidio</i>	Heinemann-Raintree
<i>El Olfato</i>	Heinemann-Raintree
<i>La Vista</i>	Heinemann-Raintree
<i>Hornear Pan</i>	Fardah Yusof
<i>La Cucaracha Martina</i>	Daniel Moreton
<i>Cuentos de Piratas</i>	F. Downey y S. Lorimer
<i>Franjas Anchas y Estrellas Brillantes</i>	Peter Winkler
<i>El Tiempo y las Estaciones</i>	Cory Phillips
<i>El Clima</i>	Beth Geiger
<i>Trabajos</i>	Rowan Sellers
<i>Nuestra Huella Humana</i>	B. H. Seeber
<i>Soluciones de la Naturaleza</i>	L. Hall y P. Edwards
<i>Trabajando Mano a Mano</i>	D. G. Silver
<i>Planeta Sediento</i>	B. Geiger y G. Gilbert
<i>Al Rescate</i>	L. Hall y M. Moss

Year 1 Implementation Timeline

The following table presents a timeline for the initial year of implementation of a Dual Language Bilingual Program. Due to the necessary building of skills, the program will start with the Kindergarten class as a pilot. Then, additional staff will be hired to accommodate the additional grade levels after each year.

Initiative	Beginning Date	Completion Date
Recruitment and hiring of staff	May/June before year of implementation	May/June before year of implementation
Recruitment of students	June/July before year of implementation	June/July before year of implementation
Program staff professional development and curriculum planning	July/August before year of implementation	July/August before year of implementation
Initial family orientation	August before year of implementation	N/A
Kindergarteners begin TWDL Bilingual program	September	June
Program-based assessments	September (ongoing)	June
Classroom observations from evaluation team	September (ongoing)	June
Data review meetings with evaluation team	September (ongoing)	June
Fall parent conferences	November	N/A
Mid-year Professional Development	January	February
Spring parent conferences	March	N/A
End of year program evaluation	June	July
Re-evaluation and plan for next year	June	August

Conclusion

The purpose of this guide was to create a usable implementation guide for a Dual Language Bilingual Program in the Dunkirk City School District. The completed guide addresses all components of the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education in a way that fits the needs and strengths of the district. The guide intends to promote bilingualism, biliteracy, and biculturalism for students with a home language of either English or Spanish. In turn, this will create more bilingual individuals entering middle school, high school, and eventually the workforce as well. As a teacher in the school district, I have witnessed the struggle of many English Language Learners in the current programming. I also wish to be bilingual as well, since it was not an option when I was in school. I hope that through the implementation of this guide, the school district could support its students in becoming bilingual and biliterate.

Discussion

This curriculum project was developed by researching current Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual Programs and applying aspects of them to the Dunkirk City School District. The Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education were used as a template for necessary components in the program and were suggested for further evaluation of the program once implemented. This implementation guide emerged from the need to create a Dual Language Bilingual Program specific to the needs of the Dunkirk City School District. Dunkirk currently needs a bilingual program to be in compliance with Part 154 due to the large number of Spanish speaking students in the district. After much research on effective bilingual programming, as well as a previous visit to a Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual School, I decided on this as the program to be implemented. I also tailored the guide to meet these needs while meeting the Guiding Principles of Dual Language Education (Howard, Sugarman, Christian, Lindholm-Leary, & Rogers, 2007). In the final chapter of my thesis, I will assess the implications of the work in this guide as well as the limitations of it.

Significance

This guide is significant for many school districts struggling with compliance with Part 154. Due to the rapid increase of bilingual students in the United States, more services are being required to teach them. There are many different options for bilingual students, such as push-in or pull-out English as a New Language (ENL) services, immersion, transitional bilingual programs, and dual-language bilingual programs (NYSED, n.d.). In a situation such as Dunkirk's, where there is a lack of available bilingual staff and a large population of bilingual students, the Dual-Language Program approach was most appropriate. It was also the program

highest valued after researching different types of programming due to its additive bilingualism approach and the importance of equal language and culture.

The United States is also rapidly falling behind in bilingualism. Cusido (2017) commented: “In 2010, there were roughly 240,000 job postings aimed at bilingual workers. But by 2015, that figure swelled to about 630,000. The study also showed that bilingual workers were in demand for both low and high-skilled positions such as financial managers, editors, and industrial engineers.” To compete in the expanding world job market, it is necessary that individuals be bilingual. The United States has typically taken a later approach to this, requiring a foreign language in middle school, high school, and college. However, we know that children are often able to learn a language faster than they might at an older age, especially being immersed in it. Providing the opportunity in a Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual Program for English speaking students to become bilingual enables them to compete in the job market with an advantage as well.

This guide needed to be specific enough that Dunkirk administrators could envision it being implemented. However, it also needed enough flexibility to be used by different districts as well. Also, there are many decisions that need to be made by stakeholders in the program, therefore many aspects of the guide provided suggestions rather than strict guidelines. Not only does it contain different resources necessary for the implementation of a Dual-Language bilingual program, but there is also a recommended timeline included.

To effectively use this guide, all stakeholders should be involved in the decision making process. An official implementation committee should be formed and a timeline should be created. All of the guiding principles relate to one another and need to be discussed as a unit rather than separately. They all affect one another, therefore they all should be considered for

every decision made about the program. This guide lays a solid foundation for the program to meet the Guiding Principles of Dual Language Education, but the decisions made by the implementation committee will construct the program itself. Through research based programming, a successful bilingual program in Dunkirk should contain all of the components I have included in this guide such as language allocation, multilingual environment, and equality in language and culture.

Limitations

There are multiple limitations in this curriculum project, as there is in any curricular development. The largest limitation of this project is that the design of this guide assumes readers have a background in bilingual education. If someone without this background read this guide, they would have many questions about language allocation, multilingual environment, and many other terms used. These terms were not elaborated on within the guide, but knowledge of them is necessary for implementation.

Another limitation of this project is the support needed for it to be effective. Bilingual programs are a multifaceted process, and all stakeholders need to be supportive of the program in order for it to be successful. This limits the staffing that may be able to be involved in the program. Districts may need to search for qualified staff elsewhere if there is no qualified staff currently in the district that supports the bilingual program. There also needs to be a significant number of children enrolled in the program, and families need to be committed to the program as well. This includes their children not only learning another language, but learning another culture. Finally, there needs to be financial support. The guide provides a grant that can be written in order to obtain financial support from New York State; however, this is not guaranteed, nor is it enough to sustain the entire cost of the program.

The final limitation of this project is the specificity of the guide to the school district for which it was designed for. There are many aspects of the guide that I created directly for the needs of the district that would not be practical for a district with different needs. This guide needed to be written in this way for it to be envisioned by Board of Education members. Aspects such as the class sizes, teacher characteristics, and daily scheduling would all need to be modified in order to be implemented in an alternate setting. Although these components would need to be altered, they should still have the same theoretical background such as language and cultural equality.

Future Investigations

If I were to complete this project again, I think it would be best to expand more on the phases of implementation. In this guide, I focused on the final implementation as well as the very first phase, however it is much more complex than this. Writing out a realistic timeline, including the implementation at every grade level, would be more beneficial to the real process. In order to do this, I would have a discussion with building administrators and their implementation teams of current Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual Programs.

Additionally, I would write the guide with more necessary components rather than optional components. I previously wrote this way because I wanted it to sound appealing to a district if presented to them. However, in hindsight, the program needs to have fidelity in order to be effective. The district needs to be willing to make big changes in order to accept this program and they need to “buy in” to the idea of a Two-Way Dual-Language Bilingual Program. Unfortunately, when a program such as this is not welcomed and support by the district and staff involved, the program is less effective and there is a likely chance it will fail (DeNicolo, 2016).

Also, in furthering my investigations I would include more direct access to resources to assist in the implementation of the project. There are many resources such as bilingual literature lists and curriculum options that could be included in the guide as well. This would provide users and committee members immediate options when making decisions such as what type of curriculum to use, rather than requiring them to research even further.

Conclusions

The goal of this curriculum project was to map out an effective Two-Way Dual Language Bilingual Program to be implemented in the Dunkirk City School District. Although there were limitations to this project due to the specificity of the program needs, it was successful in providing an implementation plan that could be adopted by the school district to create a program in order to meet the necessary requirements of Part 154. If this were presented to the Dunkirk City School Board, and approved, this guide could be used to set the standard for the intended program. This guide could also be used as a model for other programs with necessary modifications. The effective implementation of this dual language bilingual education program within elementary schools will significantly increase the number of linguistically and culturally diverse learners in the world today, leading them to be more successful in their education as well as the working world.

References

- Blum Martinez, R. & Baker, S. (2010). Preparing teachers of bilingual students. *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, 109(2), 319–350. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ903558&site=ehost-live>.
- Brooke-Garza, E. (2015). Two-way bilingual education and Latino students. *Educational Leadership and Administration: Teaching and Program Development*, 26, 75–85. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1062273&site=ehost-live>.
- Celic, C. & Seltzer, K. (2013). A CUNY-NYSIEB Guide for Educators. New York: CUNY-NYSIEB, The Graduate Center. Get it free here (Translanguaging Guide) <http://www.nysieb.ws.gc.cuny.edu/files/2013/03/Translanguaging-Guide-March-2013.pdf>.
- Colón, I., & Heineke, A. J. (2015). Bilingual education in English-only: A qualitative case study of language policy in practice at Lincoln Elementary School. *Mid-Western Educational Researcher*, 27(4), 271–295. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1086413&site=ehost-live>.
- Cusido, C. (2017). Report: Want the job? Be able to say so in more than one language. Retrieved May 9, 2019, from <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/latino/report-want-job-be-able-say-so-more-one-language-n732486>.
- de Jong, E. J., & Bearse, C. I. (2014). Dual language programs as a strand within a secondary school: Dilemmas of school organization and the TWI mission. *International Journal of Bilingual*

Education and Bilingualism, 17(1), 15–31. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1025744&site=ehost-live>.

DeNicolò, C. P. (2016). “School within a school”: Examining implementation barriers in a Spanish/English transitional bilingual education program. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 39(2), 91–106. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1101518&site=ehost-live>.

Dworin, J. (2011). Listening to graduates of a K-12 bilingual program: Language ideologies and literacy practices of former bilingual students. *GIST Education and Learning Research Journal*, (5), 104–126. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1062673&site=ehost-live>.

Engage NY. (n.d.) New York State Math Curriculum. Retrieved May 6, 2019, from <https://www.engageny.org/mathematics>.

Howard, E. R., Sugarman, J., Christian, D., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., & Rogers, D. (2007). *Guiding principles for dual language education*. Washington, D.C.: Center for Applied Linguistics.

Kibler, A., Salerno, A., & Hardigree, C. (2014). “More than being in a class”: Adolescents’ ethnolinguistic insights in a two-way dual-language program. *Language and Education*, 28(3), 251–275. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1031732&site=ehost-live>.

Mahoney, K. (2017). *The assessment of emergent bilinguals: Supporting English language learners*. Bristol: Multilingual Matters.

New York State Department of Education (NYSED). (n.d.) Program options for ELLs/MLLs. Retrieved October 21, 2018, from <http://www.nysed.gov/bilingual-ed/program-options-english-language-learnersmultilingual-learners>.

New York State P-12 Common Core Learning Standards. (n.d.). Retrieved May 6, 2019, from <https://www.engageny.org/resource/new-york-state-p-12-common-core-learning-standards>.

Parkes, J., & Ruth, T. (2011). How satisfied are parents of students in dual language education programs?: “Me parece maravillosa la gran oportunidad que le estan dando a estos ninos.” *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 14(6), 701–718. Retrieved from <http://dbsearch.fredonia.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ948790&site=ehost-live>.

Vogt, M., & Echevarría, J. (2011). *99 ideas and activities for teaching English learners with the SIOP model*. Boston: Pearson Allyn and Bacon.