

The Epidemic Domestic Sex Trafficking of Girls: *Awareness and Prevention*



Jessica R. Semon

The College at Brockport, State University of New York

Keywords: Female Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking, Sex Trafficking, Human Trafficking, Human Rights, Girls, Women, Exploitation, DMST

Abstract

Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking (DMST) of girls is a global epidemic requiring awareness and attention. Studies from a spectrum of human trafficking subtopics: human rights, sex trafficking, its predominance in girls and women, DMST, geography, policies, stigma, ambiguity of terminology, and vulnerable populations, connected and examined the issue from a global perspective on women and gender to its manifestation in the United States and New York State. Participants in the studies included juveniles, representatives of non-governmental organizations, law enforcement, and public officials. Measurements of risk in minors and girls, results of at-risk minors' participation in psychoeducational groups, and attitudes of first responders, social workers, and policy makers assisted conclusions and implications of this research. The findings demonstrate that stigma associated with DMST perpetuates the problem, young girls are particularly vulnerable to DMST, social construction that sexualizes girls and gender disparity in treatment of victims heightens their risk, demand fuels exploitation of girls, and laws contradict solutions. DMST can be prevented and victims rehabilitated through research, education, language and attitude.

According to the United Nations (2002), human trafficking is growing more rapidly than all other organized crime (p. 166). The domestic sex trafficking of girls is an epidemic problem that needs addressing. As awareness grows about domestic minor sex trafficking (DMST) public perspectives change, but stigma remains a barrier to necessary systematic change, which would include protection and support of girls and women who have been victims of DMST or are at risk of DMST. Sex trafficking is a complex issue with many areas worthy of investigation. This paper focuses on some main aspects of the DMST issue and proposes some key methods to stop it. DMST prevention and the rehabilitation of its victims may be achieved through further research on the issue, education, standardized terminology, and improved methods of identification, treatment, and prevention of DMST.

One drawback of this research is that many resources were not careful to recognize the distinction between sex and gender. In some cases the research data is ambiguous as to whether it reflects all subjects who identified as women, girls, boys, and men because it uses the sex terminology of “female” and “male.” Moreover, non-binary and gender fluid identities are not measured. Additionally, the data collectors’, traffickers’, and buyers’ perception of an individual’s sex and gender is not clear in these studies.

Researchers Hodge and Lietz (2007) cite the UN Palermo Protocol (2000) as possibly the most prominent definition of human trafficking:

“Trafficking in persons” shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor of services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. (p. 164)

Sex Trafficking is a Global Issue

Human trafficking affects all countries. The U.S. Department of State found that 600,000 to 800,000 people are trafficked over international borders annually (Hodge & Lietz, 2007, p. 163). It occurs across national borders and within borders. Sex trafficking is not the only type of human trafficking, however, it is the predominant type. With 70-80% of those trafficked being female, 50% being children, and 70% of all trafficked females being commercially sexually exploited, researchers Hodge and Lietz (2007) determined that, “the largest subset of human trafficking is the sexual trafficking of young women and children” (p. 163).

Researcher Lauren Copley (2014) indicates one effect of globalization is that trade policies have damaged the economy of Latino countries, therefore, people migrate in order to find work. Traffickers profit from poverty and gender disparity in these patriarchal countries by convincing girls and women they have legitimate work in the US, and then forcing them into the commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) industry (Copley, 2014). Traffickers tell girls and women they owe money for being smuggled into the US. Latino girls and women in countries affected by trade policies often lack math skills. Education is generally not an option since they cannot afford school or lost time from work. Furthermore, the focus of traditional roles for women and girls does not include literacy. As a result of illiteracy they are unable to keep track of debt they pay and remain in “debt-bondage” for years.

Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking (DMST)

Many people have difficulty believing that DMST is a severe problem in the US, but the truth is that most women and children affected by commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) are born in the US (Cedeño, 2012). Estimates are unreliable owing to the covert nature of human trafficking, but according to researchers Banks and Kyckelhahn, 40% of cases reported to federally funded agencies between 2008 and 2010 involved sex trafficking of minors (Perkins &

Ruiz, 2017, p. 172). Shared Hope International describes DMST as the CSE of children within the US; sometimes referred to as child sex slavery, child sex trafficking, and child prostitution (Cedeño, 2012, p. 168). Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) declare it “a transaction in which the body of a child and/or youth is treated as a commodity” (p. 525). DMST includes children of all ages, predominantly girls. DMST is prolific throughout the United States (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). Indeed, research (Cavis 1999; Flower 1988) suggests that annually one to two million young people are sold into domestic sexual slavery (Countryman-Roswurm, & Bolin, 2014, p. 522). Those affected by DMST come from all socioeconomic strata, in part as a result of mass availability of internet. Researchers Tidball, Zheng, and Creswell note experts report sellers typically advertise their child victims online and search social networking sites for prey (2016, p. 54).

It is difficult to accurately identify those who are sex trafficked due their transiency. Traffickers frequently transport youth between states for sale or trade (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) discuss the “[Need ... to become educated on the risk factors, nature, and extent of DMST... for identification tools and intervention methods that help to serve and protect this marginalized population of youth and end this growing epidemic” (p. 522). Researchers note risk factors of DMST involve girls with a history of abuse and sexual victimization, runaways or “throwaways,” substance abuse and addiction, gang activity, and caregiver dysfunction; including mental illness, domestic violence, and substance abuse (Reid, 2011, p. 146).

The Stigma of DMST

Negative attitudes regarding sex work further complicate the DMST issue. Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) observed that researchers (e.g., Flowers 2001a; Morgan 2014; Thompson 1999; Smith 2014) view DMST as a choice to engage in prostitution, as a consensual act between individuals, or as a woman’s right to “sex work” for income (e.g., Doyle 2014; Morgan 2014; Smith 2014) (p. 523). Moreover, many justice and social service institutions continue to

use the term “prostitution” in describing DMST (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). In addition, they note inconsistencies in DMST terminology and controversy as to how to define the issue (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). As a result, professionals including police officers and nurses who regularly encounter victims do not treat them accordingly, therefore, victims do not receive necessary trauma care (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) conclude that, “Lost in these synonyms is the human child who should be protected rather than judged and turned away” (p. 523).

Domestic Sex Trafficking Risk Factors for Girls

DMST girls tend to be young (Cedeño, 2012). For example, human services participants in the Tidball, et al. (2016) study responded that age 11 is “ideal” for buyers and the most attractive age range is 12-14 because girls are vulnerable during that time (p. 61). Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) relate, “[Poverty; familial abuse and neglect, problematic relationships with caregivers, and drug and alcohol abuse are correlated with the risk of female DMST” (p. 525). Moreover, Flowers (2001a) determined from studies that sexual abuse is a significant predictor of DMST in young girls (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014, p. 526). Finally, Reid (2011) noted, “minority girls from low-income families, living in an urban neighborhood possessed key documented risk markers for exploitation in prostitution” (p. 153).

Numerous studies affirm Reid’s (2011) findings, which indicate the connection of derogatory self-attitudes to delinquent activities and demonstrate, “a negative self-schema, characterized by feelings of disparagement toward self and others, result[s] in heightened vulnerability to exploitation and sexual revictimization” (p. 153). Dworkin (1997) explains that with sexual abuse “The child is already “trained” for her perpetrator ... not to have any real boundaries to her own body; to know that she’s valued only for sex” (p. 143). Confounding this issue, Reid (2001) notes that traffickers typically pose as caring boyfriends offering help to minors in trouble.

Gender Disparity in the Treatment of DMST Victims

Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) declare, “legally and historically, prostitution has been defined as a gender-specific offense — or one in which the offender is female” (p. 523). Moreover, Chesney-Lind and Shelden (1998) note that, although research shows young females are at greater risk of becoming victims to sexual harassment and/or violence than young males, those who work with at risk youth view female sexuality as part of the girls’ deviance (Perkins & Ruiz, 2017). Additionally, transnational feminist activist, Ruchira Gupta (Steinem & Gupta, 2014), compared sex trafficking in India and the US and concluded, “It is based on the fact that there is gender discrimination. It’s not just class, it’s not just caste, but there is something beyond it [that] is making women unequal” (p. 180). Participants in the Tidball, et al. (2016) study opined that trafficked girls are inappropriately and unfairly treated and prosecuted; they should be protected as victims. One participant shared that sensitivity training of law enforcement has not been well addressed (Tidball, et al., 2016, p. 62). For example, police often labeled girl victims as prostitutes and sent them back to their homes and/or charged them with prostitution, which remained on their records for life (Tidball, et al., 2016, p. 62). This assumption that trafficked girls are simply delinquents is a covert way of undermining girls’ sexual human rights, while sex trafficking is an outright violation.

The Social Construction of the Sexualization of Girls

The patriarchal roots of most cultures around the world treated women and girls as property. Buying and selling women is an extension of this socially conditioned belief. Global media constructs the sexualization of girls and promotes sexual violence. Accordingly, Kotrla (2011) explains that the glamorization of pimping through many mediums of daily life, such as: clothing, music, television, video games, and other types of entertainment have created a culture of tolerance regarding commercial sex. In addition, Rachel Lloyd observes that we live in “a culture that continuously objectifies girls and women and that sexualizes and commodifies youth” (Cedeño, 2012, p. 159). Kimberly

Kotrla (2010) further illustrated this by sharing research from Shared Hope International (n.d.) showing that four countries with large commercial sex markets — Jamaica, the Netherlands, the United States, and Japan— tolerate sex trafficking.

Demand for Young Girls Fuels Exploitation

Cedeño (2012) pinpoints, “Pimps target vulnerable youth because people are willing to pay to have sex with children. Demand for sexual acts with children is therefore the driving force behind the child sex trafficking industry” (p. 163). Buyers excuse their behavior with the belief that women in prostitution are different from other women (Cedeño, 2012). Changing the attitude that it is acceptable to sell women and girls as sexual objects is paramount. As long as this practice is culturally normalized, it will be difficult to deter men from becoming buyers.

Raising fines to buyers for prostitution charges could deter repeat offenses and significantly reduce the demand for a supply of young girls for CSE since it would create an economic hardship for the buyer. Steinem discussed what is known as the third way; not criminalizing the buyer (jailing), but penalizing, and educating him (Steinem & Gupta, 2014, p. 192). This approach could have far-reaching positive results in preventing repeat offenders. When society has widespread awareness of the effects of prostitution on sex trafficked victims, and when the cost of being charged for buying becomes too high, men will stop buying women and girls to avoid repercussions that affect their reputations and livelihoods. When there are no buyers, prostitution will no longer be profitable for pimps. Without prostitution, there is no longer a drive to traffic women and girls for sex.

Comparing Anti-Trafficking, Sexual Abuse, and Prostitution Laws

Positive legislation has resulted from greater awareness of human trafficking. The 2007 New York Penal Law 230.34 addresses trafficking including sex trafficking (Cedeño, 2012, p. 169). Cedeño, (2012) citing McKinney (2005), states that New York Criminal Procedure Law § 440.10(1)(i)

on prostitution allows that if the person is convicted for an offense as a result of being sex trafficked under section 230.34 or the federal Trafficking Victims Protection Act, she can move to have those offenses expunged. Victims typically need legal assistance to attain this. New York (NY) has also charged the New York State (NYS) Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance and the Division of Criminal Justice Services with providing specialized social services to victims of trafficking (Cedeño, 2012, p. 169). Additionally, the TVPA (2000) is a federal law that addresses sex trafficking, including DMST. New York's recent undertaking to protect commercially exploited youth is the passage of the Safe Harbor Act, "which [cited in, Governor Paterson Signs Law to Protect Sexually Exploited Youth 2008] decriminalized child prostitution and recognized that these children are victims—not criminals—in need of special social services" (p. 171).

Conflicts abound in New York State anti-trafficking, sexual abuse/assault, and prostitution laws. Cedeño (2012) illuminates with her research, that New York State does not adequately target the demand side, meaning the buyers, of the criminal industry. Furthermore, New York's prostitution statutes categorize children that are sold for sex differently than children who are sexually abused without the exchange of goods or money (Cedeño, 2012). Cedeño explains, "once money is exchanged the lack of consent presumption no longer applies and that same child could be charged with prostitution" (Cedeño, 2012, p. 167). Additionally, anti-trafficking law contradicts the TVPA and the UN Protocol to Prevent and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, in that NY requires proof of coercion in order for the child to receive services (Cedeño, 2012; United Nations, 2000). More problematic is that Safe Harbor does not provide funding to carry out the mandates within the law. Lastly, NYS does not provide equal protection because youth over 16 are unable to petition as a person in need of supervision (PINS) and are tried as adults under NYS Family Court (Cedeño, 2012). Cedeño (2012) recommends that NY amend the anti-trafficking statute and Safe Harbor to remove the requirement to prove coercion and to allow all youth, including 16 and 17 years olds, to qualify for PINS.

Measures to Prevent the Sexual Exploitation of Girls

Prevention of DMST requires a multi-level approach. Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) suggest actions to respond to DMST including the following: reframing sex trafficking as a form of abuse requiring response from a human rights perspective, committing to serve sexually exploited children and address their trauma, and providing a common language to facilitate an effective community response. Based on her research, Reid (2011) suggests that providing services to caregivers with challenges, such as parenting classes, addiction treatment, and assistance for domestic violence could quell the escalation of DMST. Crisis-lines and mobile vans that provide food, clothing, hygiene, and shelter to help runaway, homeless, and street youth (RHSY) with daily living needs may prevent them from obtaining these needs using survival sex. Social services and related human services must address long-term needs such as transitional housing, case management, counseling, and legal assistance. Reid (2011) advises development of training materials, identification tools, and intervention methods for social workers to provide services and protection to vulnerable youth.

Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) explain that social workers need to address survivors' trauma in a way that is empowering and reduces their vulnerability. For example, Reid (2011) proposes, "strategies centered on reprocessing cognitions of not being deserving of healthy relationships and shaping new beliefs of worthiness in relation to others" as well as "interventions fostering the skills and knowledge necessary to maintain healthy and romantic sexual relationships" (p. 154). Girls need to learn how to assert their choice. As Steinem once advised, "Nobody has a right to sell our body. You have a right to decide as you grow up about your own choices so nobody owns you" (Steinem & Gupta, 2014, p. 181).

Ferrer-Wreder et al. (2004) found psychoeducational groups improve cognitive and social skills (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). Additionally, Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) assert that the groups improve self-esteem, hopefulness, and interpersonal skills for those with multiple sexual abuse trauma. Lloyd (2011) confirms, these groups can also be effective in developing

needed skills to decrease vulnerability to DMST and increase awareness of the issue, such as the influence of the media's portrayal of sexual exploitation and the risks associated with DMST regarding race, gender, and socioeconomic status (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014). In their study of youth at risk for DMST, Countryman-Roswurm and Bolin (2014) found that 70% of the participants said that the group taught them ways to develop healthier relationships with themselves, peers, family members, and dating partners. Additionally, 88% understood how to handle an abusive relationship and/or being sex trafficked (Countryman-Roswurm & Bolin, 2014, p. 533).

With DMST existing throughout the U.S. and all over the globe, it has reached epidemic proportions. Aggressive growth of human trafficking has the potential to affect vulnerable populations throughout the world, regardless of their cultural background. Through research, education, language utilization regarding the victims of DMST, improved laws and enforcement, and strategic approaches using consistent terminology in social work and related human services, DMST is preventable and its victims rehabilitatable. Increased recognition of DMST has begun to change perspective about CSE, although stigma hinders needed systemic modifications to protect and support girls and women.

References

- Cedeño, M. (2012). Pimps, johns, and juvenile prostitutes: Is New York doing enough to combat the commercial sexual exploitation of children? *Cornell Journal of Law and Public Policy*, 22(1), 153-179.
- Copley, L. (2014). What does policy have to do with it? The political economy of Latino sex trafficking in the United States. *Crime Law and Social Change*, 62, 571-584.
- Countryman-Roswurm, K., & Bolin, B. L. (2014). Domestic minor sex trafficking: Assessing and reducing risk. *Child and Adolescent Social Work Journal*, 31, 521-538
- Dworkin, A. (1997). *Life and death: Unapologetic Writings on the Continuing War Against Women*. New York, NY: The Free Press.
- Hodge, D. R., & Lietz, C. A. (2007). The international sexual trafficking of women and children: A review of literature. *Journal of Women and Social Work*, 22(2), 163-174.
- Kotrla, K. (2010). Domestic minor sex trafficking in the United States. *Social Work*, 55(2), 181-187.
- Perkins, E. B., & Ruiz, C. (2017). Domestic minor sex trafficking in a rural state: Interviews with adjudicated female juveniles. *Child and Adolescent Social Work Journal*, 34, 171-180.
- Reid, J. A. (2011). An exploratory model of girl's vulnerability to commercial sexual exploitation in prostitution. *Child Maltreatment*, 16(2), 146-157.
- Steinem, G., & Gupta, R. (2014). Trafficking sex: Politics, policy, personhood. *Meridians: feminism, race, transnationalism*, 12(1), 172-200.
- Tidball, S., Zheng, M., & Creswell, J. W. (2016). Buying sex on-line from girls: NGO representatives, law enforcement officials, and public officials

speak out about human trafficking—A qualitative analysis. *Gender Issues*, 33, 53-68.

United Nations. (2000). *Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children*. Retrieved from <https://treaties.un.org/doc/Publication/CN/2008/CN.532.2008-Eng.pdf>

United Nations. (2002). *The United Nations response to trafficking in women and girls*. Retrieved from <https://reliefweb.int/report/world/thematic-issues-commission-status-women-report-secretary-general-ecn620037>